



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

history of the famous settlement on the banks of the Red River, in what is now the province of Manitoba. As the first serious attempt to apply the methods of modern scholarship to the history of the Red River settlement, Professor Martin's book is one of very great interest. He has brought an extraordinary wealth of material to the elucidation of a somewhat complicated question. There can be no doubt that he has succeeded in throwing a great deal of new light on the motives and personality of Selkirk, and of those who were associated with him. It is not so certain that in his account of the long and bitter fight between Selkirk and the Northwest Company, he has been quite fair to the latter. Such characterizations of the company as those he quotes from Selkirk's letters, "one of the most abominable combinations that ever was suffered to exist in the British Dominions", "the N. W. Co. who with the exception of the Slave traders are perhaps the most unprincipled men who ever had to boast of support and countenance from the British Government", "the most detestable system of villainy that ever was allowed to prevail in the British Dominions", may be interesting as illustrating Selkirk's attitude of mind, but are hardly convincing to the impartial student of history. In fact one is left with the impression after reading these interesting chapters that, in his effort to rehabilitate Lord Selkirk, Professor Martin has been less than just to the Northwest Company.

One criticism may be offered as to the form of the study. There seems to be a rather unnecessary repetition of the same quotations. For instance, on page 17 he quotes Selkirk's father, "I have known many lads of sixteen, who, as the vulgar saying is, could have bought and sold you in a market", and Selkirk's own reference to his "natural shyness and cold temper". Both these comments are repeated on pages 192-193. See also pages 19 and 92, pages 35 and 190, pages 55 and 171, pages 79 and 105, pages 95 and 102, pages 102 and 180, pages 103 and 180, pages 126 and 132, pages 143 and 145, pages 181 and 185. While it is a little difficult to see the need of such redundancy, with such a wealth of material as Professor Martin had at his command, the criticism is merely one of form and does not of course seriously affect the value of the book to the student. In an appendix Professor Martin gives the text of the Hudson's Bay Charter of 1670, and several other important documents relating to the fur-trade or the Selkirk Settlement. A very full bibliography and three maps add materially to the usefulness of the study.

Bolívar y la Emancipación de Sur-América: Memorias del General O'Leary. Traducidas del Inglés por su Hijo SIMÓN B. O'LEARY. [Biblioteca Ayacucho, bajo la Dirección de Don Rufino Blanco-Fombona.] In two volumes. (Madrid: Sociedad Española de Librería. 1915. Pp. 705, 805.)

Ultimos Años de la Vida Pública de Bolívar: Memorias del General O'Leary. Tomo Apéndice, 1826-1829. [Biblioteca Ayacucho.] (*Ibid.* 1916. Pp. 580.)

Independencia Americana: Recuerdos de Francisco Burdett O'Connor. Los publica su Nieto F. [sic] O'Connor D'Arlach. [Biblioteca Ayacucho.] (*Ibid.* 1915. Pp. 416.)

Memorias del General José Antonio Páez: Autobiografía. [Biblioteca Ayacucho.] (*Ibid.* 1916. Pp. 481.)

Memorias de un Oficial de Ejército Español: Campañas contra Bolívar y los Separatistas de América. [Biblioteca Ayacucho.] (*Ibid.* 1916. Pp. 309.)

Memorias del General García Camba para la Historia de las Armas Españolas en el Perú. [Biblioteca Ayacucho.] In two volumes. (*Ibid.* 1916. Pp. 583, 603.)

FOR the historian of the Spanish-American wars of independence there is an abundance of printed descriptions by participants in the struggle which supplement admirably the manuscript material preserved both in Spain and in the republics that were formerly its colonies. How little these sources have been utilized is patent from the fact that there is no general account of the period based on even a part of them. For such neglect a number of reasons might be adduced. To begin with, Spaniards and Spanish-Americans, it would seem, have preferred to accept domestic productions of partizan pens as altogether satisfactory to their patriotic sentiments. The assertions contained in literature of the sort are held to lie beyond the range of the shafts of criticism; they constitute a species of law and gospel quite incapable of contradiction, and hence appropriate to the cult of "authority" summed up in that expressive, but untranslatable word, "indiscutible". Foreign writers, on the other hand, if they take any interest in the subject at all, either deal with some particular episode or personage, or else content themselves with repeating, or enlarging upon, stereotyped versions that are readily accessible. Rarely have they ventured into the field of original investigation.

A further reason why narrators of the contest that shook off the yoke of Spain from the continents of America have made scant use of the printed memoirs or recollections of the men who took part in the great drama is, that material of the sort has been so difficult to find. The editions were extremely limited, often published in the cheapest form, alike in paper and typography, and issued sometimes in out-of-the-way places. If they happen to have seen the light of day in Spain or in Spanish America, the task of hunting them becomes formidable indeed, when one looks into the majority of the "bibliografías" and "bibliotecas" which purport to furnish information about the products of the press in those areas, subsequent at least to 1810.

Students interested in the period under consideration, therefore, owe a debt of gratitude to Rufino Blanco-Fombona, the distinguished Venezuelan littérateur, now resident in Madrid, for the *Biblioteca Ayacucho* put forth under his editorship, and which is to contain the most important of the available recollections and memoirs. He has rendered this service, not alone as a Venezuelan who venerates the name of Bolívar, nor even wholly as a Spanish-American seeking to evoke the glorious deeds of the patriots of yore, but as a scholar and a man of letters who believes that science and truth can discover no field of human interest richer in its reward to research than the story of what occurred in Spanish America, from the displacement of the rightful king of Spain by the might of Napoleon Bonaparte to the battle that overthrew forever the power of the mother-country on the mainland of the western world. Accordingly, whether the works in question were favorable or unfavorable to the cause of independence, whether written by Spaniards, Spanish-Americans, or foreigners, all are to be included in the *Biblioteca Ayacucho*, "whenever in any respect they are worthy of preservation".

The volumes in the series which have appeared thus far are altogether superior to the original prints in everything that goes into the art of the book-maker. The volumes are provided also with new titles, both general and special, with some form of introduction appreciative of the author and his work, and occasionally with corrective or explanatory foot-notes by the editor. Except in one case, however, no indication is vouchsafed as to the exact original title, date, and place of publication of the works reprinted, nor indeed any statement that they are reprints at all. Biographical data, whenever any are given, are quite scanty, and sometimes erroneous. Were the editorial comments, also, more copious and more scientifically critical in character, and had each of the texts been followed by an alphabetical index, the series would have been more serviceable to the student.

Daniel Florence O'Leary, the author of the first set of *Memorias*, was a member of the famous British and Irish "legion" that served under the orders of Bolívar from 1818 onward, and that had a very important, if not decisive, share in the struggle against the forces of Spain. After the war, from 1842 to 1843, he became British consul at Puerto Cabello, and from 1843, chargé d'affaires and consul general at Bogotá, where he died in 1854.

While performing his military duties, O'Leary began to collect documentary material that might serve to elucidate the history of the wars of independence, so far as northern South America was concerned, and in particular to portray the career of Bolívar himself. Most of this material, now in the archives at Caracas, was published there, between 1879 and 1888, in thirty-two volumes under the comprehensive caption, *Memorias del General O'Leary*. None of them, properly speaking, contains memoirs. All, except two, are filled with "Correspondencia", "Documentos", "Cartas del Libertador", and other documentation.

The two in question contain an historical treatise based on the foregoing material, written by O'Leary in English and completed in 1840. For the purpose of inclusion in the *Memorias* the manuscript was translated into Spanish, and the work given the vague title of *Narración*, by his son, Simón B. O'Leary, under whose supervision the collection was published. Though numbered separately "tomo primero" and "tomo segundo", the two volumes form in reality the twenty-seventh and twenty-eighth of the *Memorias*. Because of a designation so "colorless, tasteless and sexless" (page 8^s) as *Narración*, the present editor has changed it to *Bolívar y la Emancipación de Sur-América*, as more explicit, if not also more grandiose.

In the reprint the "Advertencia", prefixed to the original edition, is inserted as a part of the editor's introduction, and the lengthy and confusing summaries that preceded the individual chapters are omitted. For the sake of readability, furthermore, the unduly long chapters themselves are broken up into sections, and both chapters and sections are provided with titles and dates that are thoroughly distinctive. In the interests of clarity a few changes have been made in the author's footnotes, but in the main the original text of the translation is preserved, even to the misspellings. To the same end, all intercalated documents are printed in a type distinct from that of the text proper, an improvement on the original, which usually spaced them more narrowly without further difference.

Apart from an introductory sketch of colonial institutions and the outbreak of the revolution, the treatise of O'Leary is substantially a biography of Bolívar, along with an incidental description of military campaigns and other events in northern South America, chiefly between 1818 and 1826. Only at the point (vol. I., ch. 22), where the author tells of his arrival at Angostura in March, 1818, as a seventeen-year-old ensign in the "Red Hussars", does a semblance of memoirs begin to appear, and even here the personal element is kept rigorously subordinate. While the reviewer cannot subscribe to the statement of the editor (page 8²), that "among no people, regarding no epoch and no personage does there exist a work superior to this work in respect of the documentation" upon which it is founded, he does share in the main Sr. Blanco-Fombona's estimate of its intrinsic worth as a sympathetic story of Bolívar's life. No other contemporary account of Spanish-American conditions, certainly, rests on so vast an amount of documentary evidence of every sort, carefully sifted and evaluated; although from the standpoint of the military historian, the work lacks the gift of synthesis which reveals the general lines of campaigns, without dwelling unduly upon individual or isolated operations or the activities of irregular bands. The reviewer, moreover, agrees with Sr. Blanco-Fombona in his opinion that the Venezuelan government committed a grievous blunder when it charged Simón B. O'Leary, whose literary talent was quite inferior to that of his father, with the task of converting good

English into indifferent Spanish. Mere "routine, blindness and dullness" (page 8^s), on the part of that government, in fact, still deprive the English-speaking world of the original. Here is a situation that one may hope will not be long in finding a remedy.

At the time of printing the *Narración* a third volume had been prepared, containing a number of notes and diaries and intended to serve as an *Apéndice*, covering the years 1826-1829. It gave an account of O'Leary's missions to Colombia and Peru, of the convention of Ocaña and of the conspiracy against Bolívar in 1828. Because of the inclusion of certain communications alleged to be derogatory to the memory of the Liberator, the printing of the volume was officially suspended, and only a few copies appeared. Thereupon the three volumes of *Cartas del Libertador*, coming after the *Narración*, were numbered respectively XXIX., XXX., and XXXI. in a clumsy attempt to conceal the suppression of the *Apéndice*. In 1914, however, the material of the missing volume was republished at Bogotá by a grandson of O'Leary, and made to include in its entirety a letter from Sucre to Bolívar which had been left incomplete in the original printing; and at Caracas also the loose sheets (*pliegos*) remaining from the first edition were bound and put into circulation. The present work, under the caption, *Últimos Años de la Vida Pública de Bolívar*, is a sort of third edition. Like the Bogotá version it contains the full text of the Sucre letter, and in addition it has a preface by the editor and an "Introducción" taken from Segundo Sánchez's excellent "Bibliografía Venezolanista".

Francis Burdett O'Connor, a nephew of Arthur O'Connor, was another member of the "legion". He came to Venezuela in 1819 as lieutenant-colonel of a regiment of lancers belonging to a contingent raised by John Devereux, an Irishman once resident in the United States. In the battle of Ayacucho he served under Sucre as chief of staff. His *Memorias*, edited by his grandson, Tomás O'Connor D'Arlach, who contributed also a biographical preface, were first published at La Paz, and later at Tarija in 1895. Somewhat more than one-third of the work deals with the period between 1819 and 1824, and touches upon the history of Great Colombia, Peru, Bolivia, Chile, and the United Provinces of the Rio de la Plata; the remainder is concerned chiefly with Bolivia and its international relations up to 1839, at which point the text ends quite abruptly.

Though a man of excellent education, and able to speak several languages fluently, O'Connor was not a *littérateur*. His simple, direct account of his experiences, on the contrary, shows the training and instincts of the soldier. The sincerity of his judgments, also, as well as the impartiality of his opinions and his conscientious endeavor to tell what he thought was true, make most of his statements well worthy of confidence. Where he resorts to criticism, even of a man so idolized as Sucre, he is seldom, if ever, bitter or unreasonable.

José Antonio Páez, the chief of the redoubtable "llaneros" of Vene-

zuela, the hero of "about face" at "La Mata de la Miel", and the man who won the day at Carabobo, wrote his *Autobiografía* as an exile in New York, where he died in 1873. The work, in two volumes, appeared there in three editions, the first in 1867 and the third in 1878. It covers the period from the birth of Páez, in 1790, up to 1850, and, as might be supposed, deals almost wholly with conditions in Venezuela.

The present reprint omits the "Introducción" prefixed to the original, without any allusion to the fact, and substitutes for it the eloquent "Apreciación" of Páez by José Martí, the Cuban poet and journalist. Furthermore it cuts off the *Autobiografía* proper at volume I., chapter XX., or about 1827, when Páez was confirmed in his position as "Jefe Superior" and was contemplating the project of Bolívar to send him to revolutionize Cuba. For these omissions and abbreviations Sr. Blanco-Fombona offers a number of reasons (p. 481, note), which appear to reveal something of an animus of Venezuelan politics against the former chieftain. He declares that the volume is cut off at the moment when Páez exchanged "the sword that was placed in his hands by Bolívar for the presidential cane". This is not strictly true, because Páez did not become president of Venezuela till 1831. Another reason avers that Páez was no longer the "epic Páez, defender of his country and one of its founders . . . but Páez a partizan chief who has deserved at times the severe recriminations of history". Be this as it may, it seems only fair that the old Venezuelan warrior should have been afforded, in his "Introducción", no less than in the chapters following the twentieth, a chance to defend himself in his own characteristically vigorous, verbose, and withal imperious, fashion that seldom evinces either signs of vanity or indications of a desire to belittle his contemporaries. Still another reason adduced by the editor in this connection states that the later chapters do not "concern America at large so much as the history of Great Colombia to 1830, and thereafter the history of Venezuela". If this be the case, then *mutatis mutandis* the *Memorias* of O'Connor ought similarly to have been cut off by nearly two-thirds. Moreover, the *Autobiografía* does not extend to the "latest years" of the life of Páez, but only to 1850.

On the royalist side of the struggle for independence one of the most interesting of the series of recollections of the times is that composed by Rafael Sevilla, a captain of infantry who accompanied the expedition of Morillo to Venezuela in 1815, and who fought in the campaigns up to 1821, when the Spanish forces surrendered at Cumaná. Later he continued his military career in Porto Rico, where he died in 1856. Sevilla's work was first published there in 1877 under the caption, *Memorias de un Militar sacadas de un Libro Inédito y arregladas por D. José Pérez Morris*, and subsequently, in 1903, at Caracas and Maracaibo, with a prologue by J. R. Díaz Valdeparés. The latter edition is the one from which the present reprint is made. To the narrative proper are appended an account of the battle of Trafalgar, which the Spanish officer wit-

nessed as a ten-year-old lad from the housetops of Cadiz, and also a list of his services and honors.

Without pretense to literary ability, often lacking in correctness of style, permeated with a strong royalist bias and typically Andalusian in its bits of exaggeration, Sevilla's account nevertheless is a simple, ingenuous, and readable story of "episodes ridiculous and sublime, of picturesque scenery and characters, of hours of laughter and tears". It is especially valuable because of the picture it draws of Pablo Morillo, the great Spanish soldier, to whose skill and bravery, as well as to the memory of the men who followed him on South American battlefields, Sr. Blanco-Fombona's "Apreciación" pays a graceful and eloquent tribute.

Like Sevilla, Andrés García Camba came to Venezuela with Morillo. Under that officer he served as chief adjutant of hussars. Later, as brigadier in command of the Spanish cavalry, he fought in the battle of Ayacucho. Still later, on his retirement to Spain, he was promoted to a generalship, became acting minister of war and eventually was appointed captain-general of the Philippines. His recollections were first published at Madrid in 1846 under substantially the same title as they bear in the present reprint; but the latter lacks the map of South America which appeared in the second volume of the original.

So far as the form of the work is concerned, the *Memorias* of García Camba resemble those of O'Leary. Instead of being memoirs in the proper sense, like the accounts written by O'Connor, Páez, and Sevilla, they take the shape of an historical description of the occurrences in America between 1809 and 1825, based partly on a somewhat superficial study of documents, of which many are given in the text and appendix, and partly also on recollections. They have independent value only for the period from 1815 onward. Of all the treatises prepared by Spanish officers, however, García Camba's is probably the best. Particularly is this true for the precision with which it portrays the military operations in Peru, and for the service it renders in checking the *Memoirs* of William Miller, the Englishman.

As pointed out by Sr. Blanco-Fombona, the work differs from all of its fellows in having had a political motive for its composition. Several of the Spanish officers who figure in it, and who had fought during the final struggles in Peru and Bolivia, later occupied high official station in the mother-country. Canterac, for example, became military governor of Madrid; Rodil, president of the council of ministers; and Espartero, regent of the kingdom. García Camba's *Memorias* were written to defend their deeds and the memory of the fallen, against the sneers of the politicians of Madrid, or "Persians" as they were termed, who had seen fit to dub the Spanish soldiers of the last days in America, "Ayacuchos".

WILLIAM R. SHEPHERD.